

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ILLINOIS  
EASTERN DIVISION**

FRANK CARBONE, *et al.*, individually and on behalf  
of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiffs,

v.

BROWN UNIVERSITY, *et al.*,

Defendants.

Case No.: 22-cv-00125

Hon. Matthew F. Kennelly

**JOINT STATUS REPORT REGARDING PROPOSED ESI PROTOCOL ORDER**

On November 7, 2022, the parties submitted a Joint Status Report (Dkt. 245), in which the parties briefed their positions on several disputed issues in their draft ESI Protocol Order (Dkt. 245-1). At the November 14, 2022 hearing, the Court ordered the parties to continue discussions regarding one of those disputes, whether Defendants would be required to preserve public-facing admissions and financial aid websites.

The parties have had continued discussion and have reached an accord on that issue, pursuant to which the parties agree that subsection I(F) of the ESI Protocol will just read “public-facing websites.” Separately, the parties have agreed that the language “and what Party each such attorney represents” can be deleted from section VI(A).

As a result, the only remaining disputed issues concerning the ESI Protocol, which were previously briefed, are those concerning (1) data housed on emergency backup systems, and (2) privilege logs/redactions. The parties submit that those issues are ripe for resolution by the Court.

Dated: December 5, 2022

Respectfully submitted,

By: /s/ Edward J. Normand

Devin "Vel" Freedman  
Edward J. Normand  
Peter Bach-y-Rita  
FREEDMAN NORMAND  
FRIEDLAND LLP  
99 Park Avenue  
Suite 1910  
New York, NY 10016  
Tel: 646-970-7513  
vel@fnf.law  
tnormand@fnf.law  
pbachyrita@fnf.law

By: /s/ Robert D. Gilbert

Robert D. Gilbert  
Elpidio Villarreal  
Robert S. Raymar\*  
Alexis Marquez  
Steven Magnusson  
**GILBERT LITIGATORS &  
COUNSELORS, P.C.**  
11 Broadway, Suite 615  
New York, NY 10004  
Tel: (646) 448-5269  
rgilbert@gilbertlitigators.com  
pdvillarreal@gilbertlitigators.com  
rraymar@gilbertlitigators.com  
amarquez@gilbertlitigators.com  
smagnusson@gilbertlitigators.com

\* *Pro hac vice*

Eric L. Cramer  
Caitlin G. Coslett  
BERGER MONTAGUE PC  
1818 Market Street, Suite 3600  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
Tel: 215-875-3000  
ecramer@bm.net  
ccoslett@bm.net

Daniel J. Walker

By: /s/ Kenneth Kliebard

Kenneth Kliebard  
MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP  
110 North Wacker Drive  
Suite 2800  
Chicago, IL 60606-1511  
Tel: 312-324-1000  
kenneth.kliebard@morganlewis.com

Jon R. Roellke  
MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP  
1111 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20004-2541  
Tel: 202-739-5754  
jon.roellke@morganlewis.com

Sujal Shah  
MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP  
One Market, Spear Street Tower, 28th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94105-1596  
Tel: 415-442-1386  
sujal.shah@morganlewis.com

*Counsel for Defendant Brown University*

By: /s/ Deepti Bansal

Deepti Bansal  
Alexander J. Kasner  
COOLEY LLP  
1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Suite 700  
Washington, DC 20004-2400  
Tel: 202-728-7027  
[dbansal@cooley.com](mailto:dbansal@cooley.com)  
[akasner@colley.com](mailto:akasner@colley.com)

Matthew Kutcher  
COOLEY LLP  
110 N. Wacker Drive  
Chicago, IL 60606  
Tel: 312-881-6500  
[mkutcher@cooley.com](mailto:mkutcher@cooley.com)

Robert E. Litan  
Hope Brinn  
BERGER MONTAGUE PC  
2001 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Suite 300  
Washington, DC 20006  
Tel: 202-559-9745  
rlitan@bm.net  
dwalker@bm.net  
hbrinn@bm.net

*Counsel for Plaintiffs*

*Counsel for Defendant California Institute of  
Technology*

By: /s/ James L. Cooper  
James L. Cooper  
Michael Rubin  
ARNOLD & PORTER KAYE SCHOLER LLP  
601 Massachusetts Ave, NW  
Washington, DC 20001-3743  
Tel: 202-942-5014  
james.cooper@arnoldporter.com  
michael.rubin@arnoldporter.com

Leah Harrell  
ARNOLD & PORTER KAYE SCHOLER LLP  
250 West 55th Street  
New York, NY 10019-9710  
Tel.: 212-836-7767  
Leah.Harrell@arnoldporter.com

Valarie Hays  
ARNOLD & PORTER KAYE SCHOLER LLP  
70 W Madison Street  
Suite 4200  
Chicago, IL 60602  
Tel.: 312-583-2440  
valarie.hays@arnoldporter.com

*Counsel for Defendant University of Chicago*

By: /s/ Patrick Fitzgerald  
Patrick Fitzgerald  
Amy Van Gelder  
SKADDEN, ARPS, SLATE, MEAGHER &  
FLOM LLP  
155 N. Wacker Drive  
Chicago, IL 60606-1720  
Tel: 312-407-0508  
patrick.fitzgerald@skadden.com  
amy.vangelder@skadden.com

Karen Hoffman Lent  
SKADDEN, ARPS, SLATE, MEAGHER &  
FLOM LLP  
One Manhattan West  
Room 40-216

New York, NY 10001-8602  
Tel: 212-735-3276  
karen.lent@skadden.com

*Counsel for Defendant The Trustees of  
Columbia University in the City of New York*

By: /s/ Norm Armstrong  
Norm Armstrong  
Christopher Yook  
KING & SPALDING LLP  
1700 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Suite 200  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
Tel.: 202-626-8979  
narmstrong@kslaw.com  
cyook@kslaw.com

Emily Chen  
KING & SPALDING LLP  
1185 Avenue of the Americas  
34th Floor  
New York, NY 10036  
Tel: 212-556-2224  
echen@kslaw.com

Zachary T. Fardon  
KING & SPALDING LLP  
110 N Wacker Drive  
Suite 3800  
Chicago, IL 60606  
312 764 6960  
zfardon@kslaw.com

*Counsel for Defendant Cornell University*

By: /s/ Terri L. Mascherin  
Terri L. Mascherin  
Reid J. Schar  
JENNER & BLOCK LLP  
353 N. Clark Street,  
Chicago, IL 60654-3456  
Tel: 312-222-9350  
tmascherin@jenner.com  
rschar@jenner.com

Ishan K. Bhabha  
Douglas E. Litvack  
Lauren J. Hartz  
JENNER & BLOCK LLP  
1099 New York Avenue, NW  
Suite 900  
Washington, DC 20001-4412  
Tel: 202-637-6327  
[ibhabha@jenner.com](mailto:ibhabha@jenner.com)  
[dlitvack@jenner.com](mailto:dlitvack@jenner.com)  
[lhartz@jenner.com](mailto:lhartz@jenner.com)

*Counsel for Defendant Trustees of Dartmouth College*

/s/ James A. Morsch  
James A. Morsch  
[Jim.morsch@saul.com](mailto:Jim.morsch@saul.com)  
SAUL EWING ARNSTEIN & LEHR  
161 North Clark, Suite 4200  
Chicago, IL 60601  
Telephone: (312) 876-7100  
Facsimile: (312) 876-0288  
IL Attorney ID #6209558

Christopher D. Dusseault (pro hac vice)  
[cdusseault@gibsondunn.com](mailto:cdusseault@gibsondunn.com)  
Jacqueline L. Sesia  
[jsesia@gibsondunn.com](mailto:jsesia@gibsondunn.com)  
GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP  
333 South Grand Avenue  
Los Angeles, CA 90071  
Telephone: (213) 229-7000

*Counsel for Defendant Duke University*

By: /s/ Tina M. Tabacchi  
Tina M. Tabacchi  
JONES DAY  
77 West Wacker Drive  
Suite 3500  
Chicago, IL 60601-1692  
Tel.: 312-782-3939  
[tmtabacchi@jonesday.com](mailto:tmtabacchi@jonesday.com)

Craig A. Waldman

JONES DAY  
51 Louisiana Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, DC 20001-2113  
Tel.: 202-879-3877  
cwaldman@jonesday.com

*Counsel for Defendant Emory University*

By: /s/ Britt M. Miller  
Britt M. Miller  
Daniel T. Fenske  
Jed W. Glickstein  
MAYER BROWN LLP  
71 South Wacker Drive  
Chicago, IL 60606  
Tel: 312-783-0600  
bmiller@mayerbrown.com  
dfenske@mayerbrown.com  
jglickstein@mayerbrown.com

*Counsel for Defendant Georgetown University*

By: /s/ Jeffrey J. Bushofsky  
Jeffrey J. Bushofsky  
ROPES & GRAY LLP  
191 North Wacker Drive 32nd Floor  
Chicago, IL 60606-4302  
Tel: 312-845-1200  
jeffrey.bushofsky@ropesgray.com

Chong S. Park  
Samer M. Musallam  
ROPES & GRAY LLP  
2099 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20006-6807  
Tel: 202-508-4600  
chong.park@ropesgray.com  
samer.musallam@ropesgray.com

*Counsel for Defendant Johns Hopkins University*

By: /s/ Eric Mahr  
Eric Mahr  
Jan Rybnicek

Daphne Lin  
FRESHFIELDS BRUCKHAUS DERINGER  
700 13th Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20005  
Tel: 202-777-4500  
eric.mahr@freshfields.com  
jan.rybnicek@freshfields.com  
daphne.lin@freshfields.com

*Counsel for Defendant Massachusetts Institute  
of Technology*

By: /s/ Scott D. Stein  
Scott D. Stein  
Benjamin R. Brunner  
Kelsey Annu-Essuman  
SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP  
1 South Dearborn Street  
Chicago, IL 60603  
Tel.: 414-559-2434  
[sstein@sidley.com](mailto:sstein@sidley.com)  
[bbrunner@sidley.com](mailto:bbrunner@sidley.com)  
[kannuessuman@sidley.com](mailto:kannuessuman@sidley.com)

*Counsel for Defendant Northwestern  
University*

By: /s/ Robert A. Van Kirk  
Robert A. Van Kirk  
Jonathan Pitt  
Sarah F. Kirkpatrick  
Matthew D. Heins  
Cole T. Wintheiser  
WILLIAMS & CONNOLLY LLP  
680 Maine Avenue S.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20024  
Tel: 202-434-5163  
rvankirk@wc.com  
cwintheiser@wc.com  
jpitt@wc.com  
mheins@wc.com  
skirkpatrick@wc.com

James Peter Fieweger  
MICHAEL BEST & FRIEDRICH LLP  
444 West Lake Street

Suite 3200  
Chicago, IL 60606  
Tel.: 312-222-0800  
jpfieweger@michaelbest.com

*Counsel for Defendant University of Notre  
Dame du Lac*

By: /s/ Seth Waxman  
Seth Waxman  
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE  
AND DORR LLP  
1875 Pennsylvania Avenue NW  
Washington, DC 20006  
Tel: 202-663-6800  
seth.waxman@wilmerhale.com

David Gringer  
Alan Schoenfeld  
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE  
AND DORR LLP  
7 World Trade Center  
250 Greenwich Street  
New York, NY 10007  
Tel: 212-937-7294  
david.gringer@wilmerhale.com  
alan.schoenfeld@wilmerhale.com

Daniel Martin Feeney  
Edward W. Feldman  
MILLER SHAKMAN LEVINE & FELDMAN  
LLP  
180 North LaSalle Street  
Suite 3600  
Chicago, IL 60601  
Tel.: 312-263-3700  
dfeeney@millershakman.com  
efeldman@millershakman.com

*Counsel for Defendant The Trustees of the  
University of Pennsylvania*

By: /s/ Norm Armstrong  
Norm Armstrong  
Christopher Yook  
KING & SPALDING LLP



1700 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Suite 200  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
Tel.: 202-626-8979  
narmstrong@kslaw.com  
cyook@kslaw.com

Emily Chen  
KING & SPALDING LLP  
1185 Avenue of the Americas  
34th Floor  
New York, NY 10036  
Tel: 212-556-2224  
echen@kslaw.com

Zachary T. Fardon  
KING & SPALDING LLP  
110 N Wacker Drive  
Suite 3800  
Chicago, IL 60606  
312 764 6960  
zfardon@kslaw.com

*Counsel for Defendant William Marsh Rice  
University*

By: /s/ J. Mark Gidley  
J. Mark Gidley  
WHITE & CASE LLP  
701 Thirteenth Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20005-3807  
Tel: 202-626-3600  
mgidley@whitecase.com

Robert A. Milne  
David H. Suggs  
WHITE & CASE LLP  
1221 Avenue of the Americas  
New York, NY 10020-1095  
Tel: 212-819-8200  
rmilne@whitecase.com  
dsuggs@whitecase.com

*Counsel for Defendant Vanderbilt University*

By: /s/ Charles A. Loughlin

Charles A. Loughlin  
Benjamin F. Holt  
HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP  
555 Thirteenth Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20004-1109  
Tel: 202-637-5600  
chuck.loughlin@hoganlovells.com  
benjamin.holt@hoganlovells.com

Stephen Novack  
Stephen J. Siegel  
Serena G. Rabie  
NOVACK AND MACEY LLP  
100 North Riverside Plaza, 15th Floor  
Chicago, IL 60606-1501  
Tel.: 312-419-6900  
snovack@novackmacey.com  
ssiegel@novackmacey.com  
srabie@novackmacey.com

*Counsel for Defendant Yale University*